

Student Achievement Partners | Text-Based Disagreement During Discussion (Grade 5)

TEACHER: Good morning, students. As you know, for the last two days, we've been reading a story called "A Game of Catch." On the first day, we read it, and we shared questions we had about the story. Then we tried to answer some of those questions by looking closely at the text.

The next day, yesterday, we read the text. And we took notes and marked the text in places where we decided whether the characters were comfortable and uncomfortable by being included or excluded. We marked it with an I or an X.

Now today, we're going to go a little bit deeper and discuss one of the questions that you guys created on Monday. Any questions right now? So our focus question for the day is, according to the text, why did Scho fall from the tree? When you get your paper, you're going to write your answer before the discussion, using our ACE protocol, which is on the chart if you need it.

I love how Madal started right away. I can see Ayana's looking for text evidence.

Need a pencil?

OK, guys. It seems like everyone's just about finished up. Before we start, let's just flip the paper over to the back. And let's just read down the left column different things that we're going to be trying to contribute to our discussion.

The first one-- almost all of us contribute as a goal. We come up with many different ideas about the story as a goal. We try to back up our ideas and details from the story as a goal. We listen and comment on one another ideas. And when asked, we try to explain our ideas and make them clear to others.

We're interested and we learn a lot. So remember, at the end, we're going to be evaluating ourself based on those. So you can put your pencil down, and we'll put our paper to the side. I'm going to repeat the focus question again. According the text, why did Scho fall from the tree?

STUDENT: The reason why I think Scho fell from the tree is because--

TEACHER: Do it from the book.

STUDENT: The reason why Scho fell from the tree is because in the text, it says--

TEACHER: What page?

STUDENT: He found a-- Oh. Page 41. It says, "He found a place where several supple branches were met to make a dangerous chair." That makes me think that it was his fault that he fell.

STUDENTS: I disagree.

STUDENT: I disagree, [Student name], because he really fell because he kept bothering the other two kids-- oh, I forgot their names. Monk and the other one. Glennie. He kept bothering them, and do Monk got mad and he went up in the tree.

And on page 44 in the text, it says, "'Now you shut up, or you'll be sorry,' Monk said, breathing hard as he reached up and threatened to shake the cradle of slight branches in which Scho was sitting. 'I won't,' Scho screamed as he fell."

This shows that Monk got mad that he kept bothering them, so he went up into the tree where Scho was sitting, and he shook the branches until he fell.

STUDENTS: I disagree.

STUDENT: I disagree too, [Student name] because it says, "he threatened to shake the cradle of slight branches in which Scho was sitting." It didn't say he did.

STUDENTS: I agree.

STUDENT: I agree with [Student name] because-- I agree with [Student name] and [Student name] because-- and I disagree with [Student name] because Monk threatened to shake it. I know this because in the text, it says on page 44, it says, "'Now you shut up or you'll be sorry,' Monk said, breathing hard as he reached up and threatened to shake the cradle of slight branches in which Scho was sitting."

So he didn't even shake it. He just threatened.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

STUDENT: And it says-- he fell because it says he sat on dangerous branches. He sat on dangerous branches. I know this because in the text, it says, "He found a place where several supple

branches were knit to make a dangerous chair and sat there with his head coming out of the leaves into the sunlight." And that's why he fell because he sat into something dangerous.

TEACHER: So what does that make you think if he sat in a dangerous seat?

STUDENT: That if it's dangerous, he could fall.

TEACHER: So why would he sit there?

STUDENT: He didn't know.

STUDENT: I think-- I think he--

STUDENT: He didn't know because it says that he just found a place where branches were there to make a chair. And he didn't know it was dangerous, so he could fall.

TEACHER: OK.

STUDENTS: I agree.

STUDENT: I agree with Jakira because on page 44, it says he threatened. And I think that Scho, he had fell on purpose because [INAUDIBLE] said that Monk was going to do it. And then because at the end, it says, "I meant you to do it. You had to. You can't do anything unless I want you to."

So that made me think that Scho fell in the tree on purpose because he wanted to make him think that he meant for him-- when he said that, he meant for him to do that.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

STUDENT: I agree with [Student name] because I think he did-- Monk did shake the tree-- not shake it, but he made him fall because it says, "'Now you shut up or you'll be sorry,' Monk said, breathing hard as he reached up and threatened to shake the cradle of slight branches which Scho was sitting."

So it said he reached up. And so before Scho said, I want, he fell because the branches near the bottom fell. That shows because Monk, he said he reached up. So I think when Monk reached up, the branches at the bottom fell, so they made the other branches fall.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

STUDENT: [INAUDIBLE] because usually, when you threaten, it doesn't actually mean you're going to do it sometimes.

STUDENT: I disagree with [Student name].

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

STUDENT: I agree with Jakira because I don't think Monk even shook the tree because it says he threatened to shake the tree. I also think he fell from the tree because he just let go. On page 44, it says, "While Monk swung down through the leaves, crying that, honestly, he hadn't even touched him. The crazy guy just let go."

TEACHER: So what does that make you think?

STUDENT: It makes me think that he just let go. And like Mia said, he might have done it on purpose.

TEACHER: What about what Monk said? What do you think about that? Did Mia go and you were going to add on?

STUDENT: Monk said-- in the text, it says on 44, "'Are you OK, Scho? Are you OK?' While Monk swung down through the leaves crying that, honestly, he hadn't even touched him." He could've-- Monk could have been lying.

TEACHER: What do you mean?

STUDENT: Saying he didn't touch him when he fell from the tree. He could have been lying.

TEACHER: OK.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

STUDENT: I disagree with you on that and I agree with Jakira because what Alami said is that he reached. The line doesn't say that he touched him. And Monk-- and Scho didn't know that it was dangerous branches because on page 41, it said, "He found a place where several supple branches were met to make a dangerous chair. Scho didn't know it was a dangerous chair. Monk and Glen didn't know either."

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

STUDENT: I agree with you, [Student name] because when you threaten somebody, doesn't mean that

you're really going to do it. It just mean, like, you better stop it or something's going to happen. He did not-- If I threatened you to do something, I'm not really going to do it.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

STUDENT: I agree with Jakira and Mia and everybody else that agreed with them because Monk-- I mean Scho, he knew that it was a dangerous tree. And Monk got mad at him, and he was like, shut up, shut up, I'll make you fall, and stuff.

So when he got on that tree, he knew Monk was getting mad at him, so he just fell out of the tree and said, I made you do it. But he really did it by himself because he knew Monk was threatening him for him to do it.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

STUDENT: I disagree with-- I disagree to [Student name] because Monk, he [INAUDIBLE] even though it said that he just threatened Scho. It also says that he reached up. But I don't think at he's just going to reach up and then his hand there. And then Scho just falls automatically.

Because even though it was a dangerous chair, Scho would have fell a while ago when he first sat down because he-- because branches can't hold his type of weight. And he didn't fell once he sat down.

So I think Monk did shake the tree because on page 44, it says, "'Now, you shut up or you'll be sorry,' Monk said, breathing hard as he reached up and threatened to shake the cradle of slight branches in which Scho was sitting." Scho was sitting on the benches that Monk was about to shake. And I think he probably was about to move his hand, and he accidentally probably shook the branch and then he fell. But he did also threaten Scho to shake so he probably did it on purpose, too.

TEACHER: Patrice, why do you think that he went in the tree to start with?

STUDENT: I think he went in the tree because Scho, he kept on saying, I want you to do this, I want you to do that. And then I wanted you to say that stuff.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

STUDENT: I disagree with Patrice because when he reached, that's when Scho fell off because Scho was

probably scared. So Scho was holding on, and then that's when Monk did like that and he fell off. And it even says that Monk was crying and he said, are you OK? Are you OK? The crazy guy just let go.

So that doesn't make sense because just because he reached, that doesn't mean that-- you said that when he reached, he not going to automatically fall.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

STUDENT: I think I would agree with Patrice because-- and to Jakira because Scho, I don't think he really saw that Monk was really going to shake the tree because if Monk is his real friend, he wouldn't do that to Monk because why would you ever want to hurt your best friend-- I mean your-- not best friend but hurt your friend?

So I think it was an accident when he fell because once Monk touched the tree, sometimes branches are, like, touching each other. So when he touched the branches, maybe it shook it and when he touched him, and when he moved his hand, he shook the whole tree and maybe Scho because you never know.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

TEACHER: I want to remind everyone to check on the wait time. Make sure no one else is trying to speak when you're going to speak. Madal go ahead.

STUDENT: I think that Scho fell from the tree because Monk actually did actually-- I agree with Moani because I do think that Monk actually touched the tree and made him fall. Because on page 44, it says, "'I'm sorry, Scho,' Monk said. 'I didn't mean to make you fall.'"

So that means that Monk knows that he did make Scho fall. That's why he said sorry.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

STUDENT: I disagree with you Madal because it didn't say that he made him. It said that he reached. When he reaches, do this, did he pull the branches?

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

TEACHER: We're not yelling. We're waiting.

STUDENT: I agree with [Student name] and Jakira, and I disagree with you, Patrice, you [Student name],

and you Madal because on page 44, it did actually say, "breathing hard as he reached up to threaten to shake the cradle." He didn't just reach up and shake the cradle. It never said he shook the cradle. And I think that Monk was apologizing to Scho because maybe he's apologizing because he threatened him.

And I think Scho fell on purpose because he wanted Monk to think that he made him do it. And it never said that Monk shook the tree. It only said that he reached up for the tree.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

TEACHER: Why do you think that he fell on purpose?

STUDENT: I think he fell on purpose because he wanted Monk to-- because once Monk said that he was going to threaten to shake the cradle of slight branches, I think Scho wanted to teach them that he really was ruling over him, being like, I made you do that.

TEACHER: OK. [Student name] again?

STUDENT: I disagree with you, Patrice, and agree with [Student name] because he-- it didn't say in the text that he really did pull the branches down so that they could fall. He just tried to say. When you threaten somebody, it means, like, you don't really mean it, but you are about to do it. But some people really don't do it.

TEACHER: OK. [Student name]

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

TEACHER: Janai, go ahead.

STUDENT: I agree with [Student name] and Mia because on page 44, it says, "Then Scho rolled away from them and sat heartily up, still struggling to get his wind. But forcing a species of smile onto his face.

TEACHER: OK. So what does that make you think?

STUDENT: It makes me think that he did it on purpose and stuff like that.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

TEACHER: That he purposely-- I want to ask her. And so he purposely did what? What do you mean?

STUDENT: That-- I think that he wanted to blame Monk because since he-- since Monk and the other person was playing catch and then he had to wait a long time. So he wanted to get back at him.

TEACHER: OK, so you're saying--

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

TEACHER: So you're saying that he framed Monk because he's trying to get back at them for not letting him play. Now, it says, smile fixedly-- after he fell on the floor, that he's sitting there smiling fixedly. So Janai if I'm correct, you're saying that he purposely fell because he wanted to set them up.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

TEACHER: [Student name]

STUDENT: I think that Scho fell on purpose because he says, "I found a wonderful seat." So on page 42, it says, "I found a wonderful seat in here," Scho said loudly, "if I don't fall out." How he even going to fall out?

TEACHER: So what do you--

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

TEACHER: So why-- hold on a second. Why would he sit in that seat? So you're saying he sat in that seat knowing it was dangerous, that he could fall out. But why would he make himself fall out?

STUDENT: Because Monk and Glenn wasn't letting him play and he wanted attention because they was playing. And he was screaming, saying, I found a wonderful seat. And yelling and everything. And they was ignoring him.

So he tried something to try and make himself fall out so that they could feel bad for him and to say sorry.

TEACHER: I want to hear from-- just a moment. We're running out of time. I want to hear from Mia, Gershwin, and Donald, and Evalise have been waiting.

STUDENT: I agree with [Student name] and [Student name] because he did want to fall out the tree to

make them-- to get their attention because they was excluding him. But he didn't know that that seat was dangerous because on page 41, it says--

TEACHER: The dangerous chair?

STUDENT: On page 42 at the top, it says, "'I found a wonderful seat here,' Scho said loudly, 'if I don't fall out.' Monk and Glennly didn't look up or comment. And so he began jouncing gently in his chair of branches and singing, yo ho, heave ho." So that makes me think that he didn't know it was a dangerous seat, because he said, I found a wonderful seat. He didn't know it was a dangerous seat until after he fell.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

TEACHER: Gershwin.

STUDENT: I disagree with you, Jakira because why would he fall out on purpose? Probably because Monk scared him and he got nervous and he tripped. Because if you fall out a tree on purpose, that person [INAUDIBLE], that would leave a mark on your back or broken a bone, you would not take that risk just to get payback with somebody.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

TEACHER: OK. Jakira, go ahead.

STUDENT: But why on page 42, it says, he found a wonderful seat. He said, if I don't fall. It says that he started bouncing gently back-- so he trying to bounce and fall, because he said, if I don't fall out.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

STUDENT: I agree with you, Jakira because like you said, he-- on page 42, he said, "'I found a wonderful seat up here,' Scho said loudly, 'if I don't fall out.'" I think that means that he was going to fall out the tree on purpose because he wanted attention, and he wanted to pay him back for not letting him play.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

TEACHER: Go ahead, [Student name]

STUDENT: I agree with Cattie because in the text, it says, on page 41, it says, "'I got an idea,' said

Glenny. "Why don't Monk and I catch for five minutes more and then you can borrow one of our gloves?" "That's all right with me." said Monk. He socked his fist into his mitt and Glenny burned one in."

So this makes me think that he wanted attention, like she said.

TEACHER: Because he-- why? Why would he want attention?

STUDENT: Because they was excluding him. They excluded him.

TEACHER: All right. Let's hear from Donald before we run out of time.

STUDENT: [INAUDIBLE] because [INAUDIBLE] it said that he reached and touched him, you said that he fell out. But when he was jumping in his, he said hi wonderful seat, saying E-I-O and stuff, wouldn't he fall out?

STUDENT: No, because--

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

STUDENT: Like you said, he was not, he didn't fall out. So then Monk, he actually touched the branch, he kind of shaked it. So then if he was bouncing, he would know don't do it too hard. Just do it a little bit to get attention. He did that because he was getting scolded.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

STUDENT: I agree with Jakira and disagree with Donald and Madal, only because Monk really didn't-- it just so-called-- that's why I agree with Jakira because it just so-called happens that once he says-- once he finds the branch, when he says, if I don't fall out, and then he starts bouncing around on the branch, then when Monk climbs up, then he falls out of the tree?

So I don't think Monk had really anything to do with it. He just made it wanted to look like-- he wanted it to look like Monk did it just so that way he can get attention because they were taking him out of the game.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

TEACHER: We're at a point where we have this question, right? Why did Scho fall from the tree. And as I'm listening to everyone, some people think that he purposely fell out. Some people think that he accidentally fell out. Some people think that Monk pushed him out. And I really can't decide,

right?

So as we've discussed, you guys have changed your mind, talked about it. What we're going to do now is you're going to take five minutes to write down what you think now.

Let me see.

So your answer kind of stayed the same? Your answer kind of stayed the same?

STUDENT: [INAUDIBLE]

TEACHER: You found more? Good. Nice job. Let me see here. So your answer changed. OK. Yes up here in three, two, and one. Thank you, Jakira. Thank you, Chelsea. Thank you, Richard.

After we had our discussion, I read some of your answers. Some of yours changed. Some of yours stayed the same. I want you to do a thumbs up if it changed, a thumbs down if it stayed the same.

So a little bit of both. What I want you to do now with the person that's hooked to your table-- discuss your answer and discuss the rubric for about three minutes. And then we're going to wrap up.

You can discuss with them three. Jakira, join in with them. Just join with them three.

[SIDE CONVERSATION]

You did. You spoke [INAUDIBLE]. Yeah. It's hard. There's a lot of people trying to talk.

Mhm. Gentle.

Did you guys discuss? What did you guys discuss?

[SIDE CONVERSATIONS]

TEACHER: What? But then there were more. No. Give me the three.

STUDENT: Scho fell out by accident, Monk pushed him out, Scho fell out on purpose.

TEACHER: Pushed him out, fell out on purpose, what was the--

STUDENT: He fell by accident.

TEACHER: Accident? But then, if he fell out on purpose, then there's different ways to look at it from here. When he fell out on purpose, did he fall out because he didn't want to get in a fight? Or did he fall out on purpose because he wanted attention?

STUDENT: But I said that.

TEACHER: So that's four. No you didn't. [INAUDIBLE] Eyes up here in five. Eye up here in four. Hans folded, sitting up and pushed in. In three, in two. Thank you. In one, and 0.

Thank you. Brandon, you with me? As I walked around, I heard you guys discuss the collaboration rubric and also your response. Me and Gershwin were just discussing, and Gershwin decided that there were three different answers. I argued with him that there were four.

OK. So I want just Gershwin to end with us by sharing what three answers he thinks everybody talked about.

STUDENT: Scho fell out by accident, Scho fell out on purpose, and Monk pushed him out.

TEACHER: OK. And then I-- did anybody else want to think there was a fourth, or a fifth, or a different--

STUDENT: [INAUDIBLE] Scho went to get, I he think he got nervous.

TEACHER: OK.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

TEACHER: Brandon?

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

STUDENT: He wanted to learn his lesson.

TEACHER: OK. Hold on. Is falling out on accident the same as-- no. Is falling out because he got nervous the same as falling out on accident?

STUDENTS: Yes.

TEACHER: Hold on. Let me hear Madal.

STUDENT: If he's nervous, he knew-- he heard Monk going on. He's like, I want you to do whatever you do. He's really getting on your nerves. So of course he's going to get nervous, oh, maybe I did something wrong. He was gonna chase me up a tree like

TEACHER: Hold on.

STUDENT: So then it's not an accident because if it was an accident, he would have known what happened. If he knew Monk pushed him--

TEACHER: Hold on, guys.

STUDENT: He touched the branches.

TEACHER: Put your hands down. Right. So it seems like we could continue talking about this. And we're going to-- I know. We're going to continue with the story tomorrow. So thank you guys. You did a great shared inquiry.

You can put your stuff away and get ready for the next.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

TEACHER: And we're clearing our desks off in five-- voices are off-- in three, in two. Cleared off in one, and 0.